



MILITARY LAW REVIEW

ARTICLES

PLEA-BARGAINING IN THE MILITARY: AN UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCE
OF THE UNIFORM CODE OF MILITARY JUSTICE

Colonel Carlton L. Jackson

THE CUSTOMARY ORIGINS AND ELEMENTS OF SELECT CONDUCT OF HOSTILITIES
CHARGES BEFORE THE ICTY: A POTENTIAL MODEL FOR USE BY MILITARY
COMMISSIONS

*First Lieutenant Melissa J. Epstein, USMC
Chief Warrant Officer Three Richard Butler,
U.S. Army (Ret.)*

PROSECUTING INDECENT CONDUCT IN THE MILITARY: HONEY, SHOULD WE GET
A LEGAL REVIEW FIRST?

Major Steven Cullen

THE FIRST FEMALE COLONEL OF THE U.S. ARMY JUDGE ADVOCATE GENERAL'S
CORPS: A SUMMARY AND ANALYSIS OF THE "ORAL HISTORY OF COLONEL
ELIZABETH R. SMITH, JR. (USA RETIRED) (1951-1978)"

Major George R. Smawley

BOOK REVIEWS

MILITARY LAW REVIEW

Volume 179

Spring 2004

CONTENTS

ARTICLES

- Plea-Bargaining in the Military: An Unintended Consequence
of the Uniform Code of Military Justice
Colonel Carlton L. Jackson 1
- The Customary Origins and Elements of Select Conduct of Hostilities
Charges Before the ICTY: A Potential Model for Use by Military
Commissions
First Lieutenant Melissa J. Epstein, USMC
Chief Warrant Officer Three Richard Butler, U.S. Army (Ret.) 68
- Prosecuting Indecent Conduct in the Military: Honey Should We Get
a Legal Review First?
Major Steven Cullen 128
- The First Female Colonel of the U.S. Army Judge Advocate
General's Corps: A Summary and Analysis of the "Oral History of
Colonel Elizabeth R. Smith, Jr. (USA Retired) (1951-1978)"
Major George R. Smawley 171

BOOK REVIEWS

- The Hunt for Bin Laden—Task Force Dagger—On the Ground with the
Special Forces in Afghanistan*
Reviewed by *Lieutenant Colonel Kevin H. Govern* 210
- Pearl Harbor: Final Judgment*
Reviewed by *Lieutenant Colonel John J. Siemietkowski* 220
- The Lawyer's Myth: Reviving Ideals in the Legal Profession*
Reviewed by *Major Gretchen A. Jackson* 228
- The Lawyer's Myth: Reviving Ideals in the Legal Profession*
Reviewed by *Major Peter H. Tran* 236

Headquarters, Department of the Army, Washington, D.C.

Pamphlet No. 27-100-179, Spring 2004

MILITARY LAW REVIEW—VOLUME 179

Since 1958, the *Military Law Review* has been published at The Judge Advocate General's School, United States Army, Charlottesville, Virginia. The *Military Law Review* provides a forum for those interested in military law to share the products of their experience and research, and it is designed for use by military attorneys in connection with their official duties. Writings offered for publication should be of direct concern and import to military legal scholarship. Preference will be given to those writings having lasting value as reference material for the military lawyer. The *Military Law Review* encourages frank discussion of relevant legislative, administrative, and judicial developments.

BOARD OF EDITORS

CAPTAIN ANDRAS M. MARTON, *Senior Editor*

CAPTAIN HEATHER J. FAGAN, *Assistant Editor*

CAPTAIN ANITA J. FITCH, *Assistant Editor*

MR. CHARLES J. STRONG, *Technical Editor*

LIEUTENANT COLONE JOHN J. SIEMIETKOWSKI, *Adjunct Editor*

The Senior Editor and Assistant Editor thank the Adjunct Editors for their invaluable assistance. The Board of Adjunct Editors consists of highly qualified Reserve officers selected for their demonstrated academic excellence and legal research and writing skills. Adjunct Editors earn points toward military retirement benefits based on the amount of time they spend editing submissions. Prospective candidates may send Microsoft Word versions of their resumes, detailing relevant experience, to the Technical Editor at charles.strong@hqda.army.mil.

The *Military Law Review* (ISSN 0026-4040) is published quarterly by The Judge Advocate General's Legal Center and School, 600 Massie Road, Charlottesville, Virginia, 22903-1781, for use by military attorneys in connection with their official duties for \$17 each (domestic) and \$21.25 (foreign) per year (*see* Individual Paid Subscriptions to the *Military Law Review* on pages vii and viii). This periodical's postage is paid at Charlottesville, Virginia, and additional mailing offices.

POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *Military Law Review*, The Judge Advocate General's Legal Center and School, United States Army, 600 Massie Road, ATTN: ALCS-ADA-P, Charlottesville, Virginia, 22903-1781.

SUBSCRIPTIONS: Interested parties may purchase private subscriptions from the Superintendent of Documents, United States Government Printing Office, Washington, D.C. 20402, at (202) 512-1800. See the subscription form and instructions at the end of this section. Publication exchange subscriptions are available to law schools and other organizations that publish legal periodicals. Editors or publishers of these periodicals should address inquiries to the Technical Editor of the *Military Law Review*. Address inquiries and address changes concerning subscriptions for Army legal offices, ARNG and USAR JAGC officers, and other federal agencies to the Technical Editor of the *Military Law Review*. Judge advocates of other military services should request distribution through their publication channels.

CITATION: This issue of the *Military Law Review* may be cited as 179 MIL. L. REV. (page number) (2004). Each issue is a complete, separately numbered volume.

INDEXING:

- * The primary *Military Law Review* indices are volume 81 (summer 1978) and volume 91 (winter 1981).
- * Volume 81 included all writings in volumes 1 through 80, and replaced all previous *Military Law Review* indices.
- * Volume 91 included writings in volumes 75 through 90 (excluding Volume 81), and replaces the volume indices in volumes 82 through 90.
- * Volume 96 contains a cumulative index for volumes 92-96.
- * Volume 101 contains a cumulative index for volumes 97-101.
- * Volume 111 contains a cumulative index for volumes 102-111.
- * Volume 121 contains a cumulative index for volumes 112-121.
- * Volume 131 contains a cumulative index for volumes 122-131.
- * Volume 141 contains a cumulative index for volumes 132-141.
- * Volume 151 contains a cumulative index for volumes 142-151.
- * Volume 161 contains a cumulative index for volumes 152-161.
- * Volume 171 contains a cumulative index for volumes 162-171.

Military Law Review articles are also indexed in *A Bibliography of Contents: Political Science and Government; Legal Contents (C.C.L.P.); Index to Legal Periodicals; Monthly Catalogue of United States Government Publications; Index to United States Government Periodicals; Legal Resources Index*; four computerized databases—the JAGCNET, the *Public Affairs Information Service*, *The Social Science Citation Index*, and *LEXIS*—and other indexing services. Issues of the *Military Law Review* are reproduced on microfiche in *Current United States Government Periodicals on Microfiche* by Infodata International Inc., Suite 4602, 175 East Delaware Place, Chicago, Illinois, 60611. The *Military Law Review* is available at <http://www.jagcnet.army.mil> begin.

SUBMISSION OF WRITINGS: Anyone may submit for publication consideration, articles, comments, recent development notes, and book

reviews in Microsoft Word format to the Senior Editor, *Military Law Review*, at Andras.Marton@hqda.army.mil. If electronic mail is not available, please forward the submission in duplicate, double-spaced, to the Senior Editor, *Military Law Review*, The Judge Advocate General's Legal Center and School, United States Army, Charlottesville, Virginia, 22903-1781. Written submissions must be accompanied by an electronic copy on a 3 1/2 inch computer diskette or CD, preferably in Microsoft Word format.

Footnotes should be typed double-spaced, and numbered consecutively from the beginning to the end of the writing, not chapter by chapter. Citations should conform to *The Bluebook, A Uniform System of Citation* (17th ed. 2000), copyrighted by the *Columbia, Harvard, and University of Pennsylvania Law Reviews* and the *Yale Law Journal*, and to *Military Citation* (TJAGSA 8th ed. 2003).

Masculine pronouns appearing in the text refer to both genders unless the context indicates another use.

Typescripts should include biographical data concerning the author or authors. This data should consist of branch of service, duty title, present and prior positions or duty assignments, all degrees (with names of granting schools and years received), and previous publications. If the article is a speech or prepared in partial fulfillment of degree requirements, the author should include the date and place of delivery of the speech or the date and source of the degree.

EDITORIAL REVIEW: The *Military Law Review* does not purport to promulgate Department of the Army policy or to be in any sense directory in nature. The opinions and conclusions reflected in each writing are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Department of Defense, the Judge Advocate General, the Judge Advocate General's Corps, or any other governmental or non-governmental agency.

The Editorial Board evaluates all material submitted for publication. We accept submission from military and civilian authors, irrespective of bar passage or law school completion. In determining whether to publish an article, note, or book review, the Editorial Board considers the item's substantive accuracy, comprehensiveness, organization, clarity, timeliness, originality, and value to the military legal community. No minimum or maximum length requirement exists.

When the Editorial Board accepts an author's writing for publication, the Editor of the *Military Law Review* will provide a copy of the edited text to the author for prepublication approval. Minor alterations may be made in subsequent stages of the publication process without the approval of the author.

Reprints of published writings are not available. Authors receive complimentary copies of the issues in which their writings appear. Additional copies usually are available in limited quantities. Authors may request additional copies from the Technical Editor of the *Military Law Review*.

BACK ISSUES: Copies of recent back issues are available to Army legal offices in limited quantities from the Technical Editor of the *Military Law Review*. Bound copies are not available and subscribers should make their own arrangements for binding, if desired.

REPRINT PERMISSION: Contact the Technical Editor, *Military Law Review*, The Judge Advocate General's Legal Center and School, United States Army, ATTN: ALCS-ADA-P, Charlottesville, Virginia, 22903-1781.

Individual Paid Subscriptions to the *Military Law Review*

The Government Printing Office offers a paid subscription service to the *Military Law Review*. To receive an annual individual paid subscription (4 issues), complete and return the order form on the next page.

RENEWALS OF PAID SUBSCRIPTIONS: You can determine when your subscription will expire by looking at your mailing label. Check the number that follows "ISSDUE" on the top line of the mailing label as shown in this example:

When this digit is 3, you will be sent a renewal notice.



The numbers following ISSDUE indicate how many issues remain in the subscription. For example, ISSDUE001 indicates a subscriber will receive one more issue. When the number reads ISSDUE000, you have received your last issue and you must renew.

To avoid a lapse in your subscription, promptly return the renewal notice with payment to the Superintendent of Documents. If your subscription service is discontinued, simply send your mailing label from any issue to the Superintendent of Documents with the proper remittance and your subscription will be reinstated.

INQUIRIES AND CHANGE OF ADDRESS INFORMATION: The Superintendent of Documents is solely responsible for the individual paid subscription service, not the Editors of the *Military Law Review* in Charlottesville, Virginia.

For inquires and change of address for individual paid subscriptions, fax your mailing label and new address to (202) 512-2250, or send your mailing label and new address to the following address:

United States Government Printing Office
Superintendent of Documents
ATTN: Chief, Mail List Branch
Mail Stop: SSOM
Washington, DC 20402

